

7 May 2018

FAO: ICANN Organizational Effectiveness Committee (OEC) of the Board & Cherine Chalaby, Chair of ICANN Board of Directors

Re: Statement of concern for At-Large Review Implementation Overview Proposal

Dear Cherine and Committee Members,

On behalf of the Contracted Party House (CPH) I would like express our deep concern with the content and intention of the At-Large Review Implementation Overview Proposal¹, which was published on the 20th of April 2018.

This proposal follows 2017's At-Large Review. During the public comment period the CPH, amongst many other SO/ACs, submitted critical feedback that was subsequently included in the recommendations in the final report from ITEMS International. These recommendations, alongside the At-Large Review and Recommendations Feasibility Assessment and Implementation Plan², were mapped out by ICANN staff³ with direct questions posed to ALAC.

The CPH is of the view that the aforementioned proposal does not address these questions, nor does it respond to specific criticisms raised in the At-Large Review report. Indeed, all the recommendations have been either flatly rejected or modified. Furthermore, if the proposal is adopted by the OEC and ICANN Board without ALAC first properly dealing with the concerns from the wider ICANN community, this would set an alarming precedent for any future ICANN Review. If critical opinions and recommendations, particularly those that are broadly supported within the ICANN community, are perceived as ultimately being ignorable, ICANN Reviews will lose credibility.

The CPH believes the Organizational Effectiveness Committee of the ICANN Board should not consider ALAC's proposal until such time as a detailed response is provided by ALAC that addresses criticism raised by the At-Large Review report, and the questions helpfully put together by ICANN staff. This response should be presented to the whole ICANN community, so that any further input from, or discussion with, the community can be arranged, to see the Review through to an appropriate end.

Yours Sincerely,

Graeme Bunton
RrSG Chair

Cc: Paul Diaz, RySG Chair

¹https://community.icann.org/display/ALRW/At-Large+Review+Implementation+Overview+Proposal?preview=/84214343/84216717/ALAC-Proposal_Aproved-20180420.pdf

²https://community.icann.org/pages/viewpage.action?pageId=69280572&preview=/69280572/71598316/At-Large%20Review%20Feasibility_Final-Revised_20170919.pdf

³https://community.icann.org/pages/viewpage.action?pageId=51417955&preview=/51417955/84215197/At%20Large%20Review_final%20mapping.pdf