



04 October 2017

Subject: SAC098: The Security, Stability and Resiliency of the DNS Review (SSR2)

Dear ICANN Board,

The SSAC is strongly committed to the aims of the quintennial Security, Stability and Resiliency of the DNS Review (now SSR2) and our members have given and will continue to give, considerable time in support of SSR2. It is therefore with considerable regret that we inform you that SSAC has serious concerns that the SSR2 effort may fail, and we request that you give it urgent and serious attention.

One basic problem with the SSR2 work is that the review team seems neither to have sufficient external instruction about what to study nor to have been able to formulate a clear direction for itself. Whatever the case, the Review Team has spent hundreds of hours engaged in procedural matters and almost no progress has been made on substantive matters, which in turn has damaged the goodwill and forbearance of its members, some of whom are SSAC members. We are concerned that, left to its own devices, SSR2 is on a path to almost certain failure bringing a consequential loss of credibility in the accountability processes of ICANN and its community.

Some seven months into the review process, the last SSR2 scorecard <[https://community.icann.org/display/SSR/Fact+Sheet?preview=/64076875/69279474/SSR2%20Review%20Fact%20Sheet%20Participation%20\(31July2017\)%20FINAL.pdf](https://community.icann.org/display/SSR/Fact+Sheet?preview=/64076875/69279474/SSR2%20Review%20Fact%20Sheet%20Participation%20(31July2017)%20FINAL.pdf)> shows 15% of milestones being accomplished, but all of these accomplishments have been process issues – for example, determining the role of observers, adopting terms of reference, determine terms of communications with the Board, and so on. On 28 September 2017, ICANN called for proposals by external consultants to perform a gap analysis of the Implementation of SSR1 Recommendations <<https://www.icann.org/news/announcement-2-2017-09-28-en>>, but this analysis will not necessarily identify new or emerging SSR issues. While it may provide useful input to the SSR2 work, it does not change the view of the SSAC.

The SSAC believes that the existing composition, structure, and processes of the SSR2 Review Team lack the necessary effectiveness to achieve the desired results.

The SSAC recommendation to the ICANN Board of Directors and the ICANN Community is to take immediate action to temporarily halt the SSR2 review and produce a detailed plan before resuming work. The current approach, if continued without significant change, will ultimately result in a report that does not have the quality expected by the ICANN Community.

Submitted on behalf of the SSAC,
Sincerely,

Patrik Fältström Chair, ICANN Security and Stability Advisory Committee